

#### An Ali Baba for Farmers: Linking Buyers & Sellers in Ugandan Agricultural Markets

Lauren Falcao Bergquist, UCB Craig McIntosh, UCSD

## Poor Integration in African Markets:

- Lack of market integration is a major issue.
  - Imperfect co-integration over space (Rashid and Minot 2010)
  - In Uganda, some improvement in major market integration since market liberalization, but distant markets remain disconnected (Rashid 2004)
- Major implications for farmer income and food security (e.g. Ethiopian famine of 1984)
- While poor roads and infrastructure often get much of the blame, increasing attention paid to other transaction costs (Fafchamps 2004)
  - Search costs
  - Credit constraints
  - Contractual risk

### Barriers to Market Integration:

- Search costs:
  - Reducing search costs dampens price dispersion (Jensen 2007, Aker 2010)
  - Simply providing price information often insufficient to raise farmer income (Aker & Fafchamps 2015, Fafchamps & Minten 2012)
  - Necessary to fundamentally shift intermediary power/actors in order to change prices (Goyal 2011, Svensson & Yanagizawa 2009)
- Credit & scale constraints
  - Need to aggregate output of many small farmers
  - Sellers themselves often lack the credit to do this aggregation.
- Contractual risk:
  - Buyers must terms will be as promised when they arrive
  - In the absence of contract enforcement, this leads to relational contracting
    (Fafchamps and Minten, 1998; Gabre-Madhin, 2001)

#### How to make markets more efficient?



### Our solution:

- Multipronged intervention providing:
  - Creation of new private-sector intermediaries with direct links to large buyers, including forward contracts for specific cash crops.
  - Implementation of Kudu, new digital trading platform for agricultural crops, allows farmers or agents to post lots
  - Use of quality/bulking certification by agents and randomized transport cost guarantees to promote digital platform.
  - Creation of large-scale SMS-based Market Survey in 241 markets, collecting price data every two weeks.
  - Creation of 'SMS Blast' system that broadcasts price data from Kudu + Market Survey to traders and farmers in treatment markets.
    - Large-scale RCT covering 12% of Uganda.

## Our Team:

- Policy Design & Evaluation Lab at UCSD.
- AgriNet: large privatesector ag intermediary.
- Kudu: new software platform from Makerere





# Kudu trade

Welcome to Kudu! Buy and sell agricultural goods in l auction system.

IPA Uganda

#### Research Design:

	Treatment	Control
Unit of randomization:		
Subcounties:	55	55
Trading Centers:		
Hub Markets	15	15
Spoke Markets	115	115
Traders:		
All	550	550
AgriNet Cas	220	
Farming Households:	1500	1500

- Randomization conducted at sub-county level.
- Pick 2-3 largest trading centers in each sub-county; become PSUs.



#### PRODUCTION AND MARKET FLOW MAPS: UGANDA MAIZE SECOND SEASON







are:

- maize surplus
- relatively remote
- deemed by Agrinet to be attractive commercial candidates for expansion.

#### Study Trading Centers: Hubs and Spokes



## Building Blocks of the Project (1):

- AgriNet
  - Largest private-sector brokerage firm in Uganda
  - 164 Commission Agents recruited by AgriNet
  - CAs are existing agricultural traders in the treatment communities
    - given training on how to bulk and quality grade,
    - how to use Kudu
    - get additional contacts to buyers through AgriNet
  - Randomized access to COB loans
  - Randomized transport guarantees to buyers

# Building Blocks of the Project (2):

# Kudu

- Designed by the College of Computing and Informatics Technology at Makerere University.
- Registered sellers post lots for sale, state reservation prices, system knows seller location.
- Buyers post bids and a ceiling price, matching algorithm finds distance/price pareto frontier and displays 3 best lots to each seller (called "matches").
- Price-setting mechanism gives buyer lowest price possible.

#### Kudu interface – Buyer Requests



#### Multi-Lingual Options – English, Luo, Luganda, Swahili



# Posting on Kudu by date





# Building Blocks of the Project (3):

#### Market Survey System

- Recruit traders to serve as enumerators in 241 markets.
- Every two weeks they are pushed out a survey and they respond by SMS.
- Open-source software being designed at UCSD.
- Training, spot-checking conducted by IPA.
- New way of providing high-granularity market data, system designed to be scaled rapidly within SSA if successful.
- Provides data capture for study as well as price inputs for interventions in treatment markets.

#### Market Price Data



## Building Blocks of the Project (4):

#### SMS Blast System

- "Downstream" price information: price information for your local market, your regional market, and Kampala or closest border market.
- "Random Blast" price information: each week we randomly sample five treatment markets and circulate price information on these markets
- Extra AgriNet price information: prices for major markets across the country collected by other firms (to which AN subscribes)
- *Kudu marketing*: advertising messages for Kudu *Kudu price*: recent prices of deals transacting on Kudu

#### Market Linkages:

Basic Schematic: Farmers sell to traders in local market trading centers.

Local traders sell on to regional middlemen who transport to large national, international markets.

D



#### Market Linkages:

Kudu: Provides direct linkage between farmers and national buyers.

Our project trains & licences AgriNet CAs to certify the quality of lots posted in Kudu.

AN to provide liquidity for bulking.

Randomized guarantees of transport costs for buyers.



#### Market Linkages:

Market survey captures prices in T & C markets biweekly.

Price data from Market Survey, Kudu fed into Blast SMS system.

Farmers and Traders sign up to receive Blast SMS, system free for first two year of project.



#### **Project Timeline:**

- Trader and farmer baselines run Spring 2015
- Season 1: July-October 2015
- Season 2: Dec-March 2016
- Trader midline survey May-June 2016
- Season 3: July-October 2016
- Season 4: Dec-March 2017
- Endline surveys Spring 2017
- Move to scale project, including widespread radio advertising, linking Kudu to other implementers

# **Cumulative sales**



# Initial signs of price convergence

#### Impact on Log Selling Price Dispersion, by Dyad

D

	maize	beans	tomato	matooke
One Market Treated	-0.0442***	-0.0478***	-0.00389	-0.000769
	(0.0043)	(0.0066)	(0.0066)	(0.0086)
Both Markets Treated	-0.0898***	-0.0945***	-0.00542	0.00939
	(0.0051)	(0.0076)	(0.0070)	(0.0095)
Constant	4.480***	5.539***	8.644***	8.185***
	(0.0067)	(0.0092)	(0.0087)	(0.0111)
Observations	269,581	184,140	315,444	210,942
R-squared	0.076	0.041	0.027	0.019

## **Challenges: Price Mismatch**



#### • Adjustments to test:

- Moving Kudu to a USSD platform that allows for more interactive relationship with customers as they post data.
- Price discovery:
  - Clear the market daily.
  - Identify sellers and buyers who do not match
  - Send them an SMS letting them know the price they would have had to post at (given location, crop, and quantity) to have matched.

# Challenges: Quantity Mismatch



# Addressing Quantity Mismatch

#### 'E-Bulking'

- Conduct intensive promotion of Kudu in treatment villages, generate high density of asks in small area.
- Use Kudu as a way of organizing and bulking large number of farmers:
  - Data visualization tools to represent best opportunities to E-bulk.
  - Use AgriNet Commission Agents as entities to conduct bulking on the ground.
  - Connect E-bulking opportunities with COB credit for CAs
  - Get farmers better prices, more reliable buyers.

# Conclusion:

- Multipronged intervention that seeks to use ICT to:
  - Reduce search costs
  - Ease credit constraints and facilitate bulking
  - Reduce contractual risk
- Preliminary results:
  - SMS information systems worked well in season 1. Kudu achieved lift-off in season 2.
  - Initial evidence of price convergence.
  - Season 3 goals:
    - Data visualizations to allow traders to identify 'buy' and 'sell' regions.
    - Improve price discovery using SMS Blast, Kudu notifications for unmatched buyers & sellers
    - Explore E-bulking, both on the ground (village-level promotion) and as an algorithmic problem.

### Weebale Nyo!

